
[JISEBI] Your manuscript is now under review

1 message

Indra Kharisma Raharjana <jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id>

4 February 2021 at 19:51

To: Merlinda Wibowo <merlinda@ittelkom-pwt.ac.id>, Herman Yuliansyah <herman.yuliansyah@tif.uad.ac.id>, Rahmasari Adi Putri Imaniati <rahmasariadiputri@gmail.com>, Anggit Wirasto <anggitwirasto@uhb.ac.id>

Dear authors,

Regarding your submission entitled "Classification Technique for Prediction Students Graduate on Time Using C4.5 Algorithm". Your manuscript is now under review stage.

Sincerely,

Indra Kharisma Raharjana
Editor-in-Chief
jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id

Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence
<http://e-journal.unair.ac.id/index.php/JISEBI>

[JISEBI] Editor Decision

2 messages

Indra Kharisma Raharjana <jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id>

17 February 2021 at 10:14

To: "Dear Sir/Madam, Merlinda Wibowo" <merlinda@ittelkom-pwt.ac.id>

Cc: Herman Yuliansyah <herman.yuliansyah@tif.uad.ac.id>, Rahmasari Adi Putri Imaniati <rahmasariadiputri@gmail.com>, Anggit Wirasto <anggitwirasto@uhb.ac.id>

Dear Authors:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence, "Classification Technique for Prediction Students Graduate on Time Using C4.5 Algorithm".

Our decision is to: REVISIONS REQUIRED

The revision comments and recommendations are described below. You shall complete the revision no longer than March 3, 2021. If you have finished all the revisions, please NOTIFY EDITOR about the improvements that have been made by filling the "OUTLINING HOW THE ISSUES ARE ADDRESSED" form provided in the last page of the template. Please feel free to contact us if you need additional time.

Indra Kharisma Raharjana
Editor-in-Chief
jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id

Reviewer A:

****Novelty and originality:** Rate the novelty and originality of the ideas or results presented in the paper.:

Minor variations on a well-investigated subject. (2)

****Technical content and scientific rigor:** Rate the technical content of the paper (e.g.: completeness of the analysis or simulation study, thoroughness of the treatise, accuracy of the models, etc.), its soundness and scientific rigor.:

Some flaws. (2)

****Quality of presentation:** Rate the paper organization, the clearness of text and figures, the completeness and accuracy of references.:

Substantial revision work is needed (2)

****Readability and English writing:**

Need major proofread (2)

****Detailed comments:** Please indicate what are the strong/weak aspects of the paper. You may add any detail comments or suggestions that should be made to improve the quality of the paper.:

Title: (Weak - must revise). It is not clear what the researchers are trying to do in this research. A weak title will impact the citation attractiveness. Please consider using a title that is captivating, short, and written with good grammar.

Abstract: (acceptable with major revision) The abstract should be written with better narratives. the background did not provide a sound reason to develop such tool.

references: these influential paper should be cited (Kamagi [et.al](#) 2014 propose very similar approach to your problem)

- Bunkar, K., Singh, U. K., Pandya, B., & Bunkar, R. (2012, September). Data mining: Prediction for performance improvement of graduate students using classification. In 2012 Ninth International Conference on Wireless and Optical Communications Networks (WOCN) (pp. 1-5). IEEE.
 - Kamagi, D. H., & Hansun, S. (2014). Implementasi Data Mining dengan Algoritma C4. 5 untuk Memprediksi Tingkat Kelulusan Mahasiswa. Ultimatics: Jurnal Teknik Informatika, 6(1), 15-20.
- otherwise, reference list are recent and related to the paper

Aims of the research: (Weak) written that the first aim is to develop a web app, but there is no link to access the app. Secondly, the web app design was not clearly written in following sections.

Introduction: (Acceptable with major revision) Introduction is acceptable, however, the problems underlying this research need to be stated more clearly with scientific / actual evidence (surveys, statistics, news, etc.). Cited works need to be included for its relevancy, not only if the research used some ML/AI methods to solve different unrelated problems.

Methods: (Weak)

- the data source was not stated clearly, possibly due to the poor grammar.
- Table 1 samples should include shuffled data.
- The narration for table 1 contains Graduation Information column, which did not appear in the Table.
- Age also did not appear, although BOD seems to suffice.
- The data count for two class is not stated. It is important to check whether it is an imbalanced class or not, and if it is, the method to overcome it.

Results: (Weak)

- Model performance test should employed a more fair approach, e.g. K-Fold cross validation
- The model should introduced more features that represents the real factor of graduation
- There is no report on the web application, as it should. (because it is included in the first aim of the research)
- Since there is big gap between accuracy, recall, and precision. The evaluation should include ROC-AUC plot and F1-score to identify the actual performance.

Conclusions: (Acceptable with major revisions)

- Should include future studies
- It is not wise to decide that a model perform successfully by Accuracy alone, please consider using F1-score

Reviewer B:

****Novelty and originality:** Rate the novelty and originality of the ideas or results presented in the paper.:

Some interesting ideas and results on a subject well investigated. (3)

****Technical content and scientific rigor:** Rate the technical content of the paper (e.g.: completeness of the analysis or simulation study, thoroughness of the treatise, accuracy of the models, etc.), its soundness and scientific rigor.:

Valid work but limited contribution. (3)

****Quality of presentation:** Rate the paper organization, the clearness of text and figures, the completeness and accuracy of references.:

Substantial revision work is needed (2)

****Readability and English writing:**

Acceptable, need minor proofread (3)

****Detailed comments:** Please indicate what are the strong/weak aspects of the

paper. You may add any detail comments or suggestions that should be made to improve the quality of the paper.:

- Need proofread
- Abstract needs revision and improvement.
- The aim is to develop a web app, but there is no explanation/description about the web app itself, such as the architecture or overall UI.
- The data in Table 1 has graduation information (5) but there is no such data in the Table 1.
- In the results, the gap value between accuracy, recall, precision is too big. How if the authors include F-1 score too? Both accuracy and F-1 score could identify the actual performance
- In conclusion, it is better to write the future work related to this study

Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence
<http://e-journal.unair.ac.id/index.php/JISEBI>

Herman Yuliansyah <herman.yuliansyah@tif.uad.ac.id>
To: rahmasariadiputri13@gmail.com

17 February 2021 at 12:43

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Indra Kharisma Raharjana** <jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id>
Date: Wed, Feb 17, 2021, 10:14 AM
Subject: [JISEBI] Editor Decision
To: Dear Sir/Madam, Merlinda Wibowo <merlinda@ittelkom-pwt.ac.id>
Cc: Herman Yuliansyah <herman.yuliansyah@tif.uad.ac.id>, Rahmasari Adi Putri Imaniati <rahmasariadiputri@gmail.com>, Anggit Wirasto <anggitwirasto@uhb.ac.id>

Dear Authors:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence, "Classification Technique for Prediction Students Graduate on Time Using C4.5 Algorithm".

Our decision is to: REVISIONS REQUIRED

The revision comments and recommendations are described below. You shall complete the revision no longer than March 3, 2021. If you have finished all the revisions, please NOTIFY EDITOR about the improvements that have been made by filling the "OUTLINING HOW THE ISSUES ARE ADDRESSED" form provided in the last page of the template. Please feel free to contact us if you need additional time.

Indra Kharisma Raharjana
Editor-in-Chief
jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id

Reviewer A:

****Novelty and originality:** Rate the novelty and originality of the ideas or results presented in the paper.:

Minor variations on a well-investigated subject. (2)

****Technical content and scientific rigor:** Rate the technical content of the paper (e.g.: completeness of the analysis or simulation study, thoroughness of the treatise, accuracy of the models, etc.), its soundness and scientific rigor.:

Some flaws. (2)

****Quality of presentation:** Rate the paper organization, the clearness of text and figures, the completeness and accuracy of references.:

Substantial revision work is needed (2)

****Readability and English writing:**

Need major proofread (2)

****Detailed comments:** Please indicate what are the strong/weak aspects of the paper. You may add any detail comments or suggestions that should be made to improve the quality of the paper.:

Title: (Weak - must revise). It is not clear what the researchers are trying to do in this research. A weak title will impact the citation attractiveness. Please consider using a title that is captivating, short, and written with good grammar.

Abstract: (acceptable with major revision) The abstract should be written with better narratives. the background did not provide a sound reason to develop such tool.

references: these influential paper should be cited (Kamagi [et.al](#) 2014 propose very similar approach to your problem)

-Bunkar, K., Singh, U. K., Pandya, B., & Bunkar, R. (2012, September). Data mining: Prediction for performance improvement of graduate students using classification. In 2012 Ninth International Conference on Wireless and Optical Communications Networks (WOCN) (pp. 1-5). IEEE.

-Kamagi, D. H., & Hansun, S. (2014). Implementasi Data Mining dengan Algoritma C4. 5 untuk Memprediksi Tingkat Kelulusan Mahasiswa. *Ultimatics: Jurnal Teknik Informatika*, 6(1), 15-20.

otherwise, reference list are recent and related to the paper

Aims of the research: (Weak) written that the first aim is to develop a web app, but there is no link to access the app. Secondly, the web app design was not clearly written in following sections.

Introduction: (Acceptable with major revision) Introduction is acceptable, however, the problems underlying this research need to be stated more clearly with scientific / actual evidence (surveys, statistics, news, etc.). Cited works need to be included for its relevancy, not only if the research used some ML/AI methods to solve different unrelated problems.

Methods: (Weak)

-the data source was not stated clearly, possibly due to the poor grammar.

-Table 1 samples should include shuffled data.

-The narration for table 1 contains Graduation Information column, which did not appear in the Table.

-Age also did not appear, although BOD seems to suffice.

-The data count for two class is not stated. It is important to check whether it is an imbalanced class or not, and if it is, the method to overcome it.

Results: (Weak)

-Model performance test should employed a more fair approach, e.g. K-Fold cross validation

-The model should introduced more features that represents the real factor of graduation

-There is no report on the web application, as it should. (because it is included in the first aim of the research)

-Since there is big gap between accuracy, recall, and precision. The evaluation should include ROC-AUC plot and F1-score to identify the actual performance.

Conclusions: (Acceptable with major revisions)

-Should include future studies

-It is not wise to decide that a model perform successfully by Accuracy alone, please consider using F1-score

Reviewer B:

****Novelty and originality:** Rate the novelty and originality of the ideas or results presented in the paper.:

Some interesting ideas and results on a subject well investigated. (3)

****Technical content and scientific rigor:** Rate the technical content of the paper (e.g.: completeness of the analysis or simulation study, thoroughness of the treatise, accuracy of the models, etc.), its soundness and scientific rigor.:

Valid work but limited contribution. (3)

****Quality of presentation:** Rate the paper organization, the clearness of text and figures, the completeness and accuracy of references.:

Substantial revision work is needed (2)

****Readability and English writing:**

Acceptable, need minor proofread (3)

****Detailed comments:** Please indicate what are the strong/weak aspects of the paper. You may add any detail comments or suggestions that should be made to improve the quality of the paper.:

- Need proofread
- Abstract needs revision and improvement.
- The aim is to develop a web app, but there is no explanation/description about the web app itself, such as the architecture or overall UI.
- The data in Table 1 has graduation information (5) but there is no such data in the Table 1.
- In the results, the gap value between accuracy, recall, precision is too big. How if the authors include F-1 score too? Both accuracy and F-1 score could identify the actual performance
- In conclusion, it is better to write the future work related to this study

Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence
<http://e-journal.unair.ac.id/index.php/JISEBI>

[JISEBI] Editor Decision

1 message

Indra Kharisma Raharjana <jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id>

4 March 2021 at 20:10

To: "Dear Sir/Madam, Merlinda Wibowo" <merlinda@ittelkom-pwt.ac.id>

Cc: Herman Yuliansyah <herman.yuliansyah@tif.uad.ac.id>, Rahmasari Adi Putri Imaniati <rahmasariadiputri@gmail.com>, Anggit Wirasto <anggitwirasto@uhb.ac.id>

Dear Merlinda Wibowo, Herman Yuliansyah, Rahmasari Adi Putri Imaniati, Anggit Wirasto,

Congratulation, your revised manuscript entitled "Classification Technique for Prediction Students Graduate on Time Using C4.5 Algorithm" has been ACCEPTED for publication in the Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence (Vol. 7 No. 1 April 2021). Your manuscript will be processed by our copy & layout editors. We will contact you if there any improvements that must be made by the authors.

Unless waived by the publisher, we now require payment to cover the publication and copy editing costs in the form of an article-processing cost (APC). The article publication cost is IDR 1.000.000 for Indonesian affiliation authors and free for international affiliation authors. This payment includes a personal copy in the form of a PDF file (front cover + your paper + back cover).

Payment is by T/T transfer:
Bank Account Name/Beneficiary: Army Justitia
Bank Name: Bank MANDIRI
Account Number: 142-00-1727175-9

We provide a hard copy of the journal with an additional fee. Please contact us for further information.

Indra Kharisma Raharjana
Editor-in-Chief
jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id

Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence
<http://e-journal.unair.ac.id/index.php/JISEBI>

JISEBI Proofread

4 messages

JISEBI Universitas Airlangga <jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id>

21 April 2021 at 13:27

To: merlinda@ittelkom-pwt.ac.id

Cc: Herman Yuliansyah <herman.yuliansyah@tif.uad.ac.id>, rahmasariadiputri@gmail.com, Anggit Wirasto <anggitwirasto@uhb.ac.id>

Dear Authors,

Within this email, we attach a proofread version of your manuscript entitled "Predicting Students Graduate on Time Using C4.5 Algorithm". For your information, the manuscript has been carefully revised by a professional language editing service in order to meet journal standards.

We need authors to make final checking, please check especially on

1. Title of Paper
2. Authors' Name and Authors' Affiliation
3. Other errors in the manuscript
4. Provide us ORCID ID of the authors (if applicable)

Your confirmation is expected until **April 23rd, 2020, at 12.00 WIB** (GMT+7) by replying to this email. If there is no confirmation, then we assume that you accept this version for publication. Please note that changes after the publication date will be published in the form of erratum or corrigendum. Vol 7 No 1 (April) 2021 will be published on April 28th, 2021.

Thank you for publishing in the Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence

Best Regards,

Indra Kharisma Raharjana
Editor-in-Chief
jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id

**07 Herman Yuliansyah.pdf**

1096K

Herman Yuliansyah <herman.yuliansyah@tif.uad.ac.id>

21 April 2021 at 14:36

To: JISEBI Universitas Airlangga <jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id>

Cc: merlinda@ittelkom-pwt.ac.id, rahmasariadiputri@gmail.com, Anggit Wirasto <anggitwirasto@uhb.ac.id>

Thank you for your email.

On Wed, 21 Apr 2021 at 13:27, JISEBI Universitas Airlangga <jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id> wrote:

Dear Authors,

Within this email, we attach a proofread version of your manuscript entitled "Predicting Students Graduate on Time Using C4.5 Algorithm". For your information, the manuscript has been carefully revised by a professional language editing service in order to meet journal standards.

We need authors to make final checking, please check especially on

1. Title of Paper
2. Authors' Name and Authors' Affiliation
3. Other errors in the manuscript
4. Provide us ORCID ID of the authors (if applicable)

Your confirmation is expected until **April 23rd, 2020, at 12.00 WIB** (GMT+7) by replying to this email. If there is no confirmation, then we assume that you accept this version for publication. Please note that changes after the publication date will be published in the form of erratum or corrigendum. Vol 7 No 1 (April) 2021 will be published on April 28th, 2021.

Thank you for publishing in the Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence

Best Regards,

Indra Kharisma Raharjana
Editor-in-Chief
jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id

--

--

*Salam

Herman Yuliansyah, ST., M.Eng.

=====

*

Program Studi Teknik Informatika
Universitas Ahmad Dahlan

Merlinda Wibowo <merlinda@ittelkom-pwt.ac.id>

23 April 2021 at 05:01

To: JISEBI Universitas Airlangga <jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id>

Cc: Herman Yuliansyah <herman.yuliansyah@tif.uad.ac.id>, rahmasariadiputri@gmail.com, Anggit Wirasto <anggitwirasto@uhb.ac.id>

Dear Editor,

Thank you for the information.

1. We found one error in the manuscript:

Page 69, we state that "The graduation predicate is addressed as Pass, Satisfactory, Very satisfactory, and Distinction (Cumlaude)." --> However, in Table 2 and 3, Distinction (Cumlaude) changed become Praise.

2. ORCID ID the other author:

- Anggit Wirasto: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1707-5979>
- Merlinda Wibowo: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1730-7258>

Thank you.

Pada tanggal Rab, 21 Apr 2021 pukul 14.37 Herman Yuliansyah <herman.yuliansyah@tif.uad.ac.id> menulis:
Thank you for your email.

On Wed, 21 Apr 2021 at 13:27, JISEBI Universitas Airlangga <jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id> wrote:

Dear Authors,

Within this email, we attach a proofread version of your manuscript entitled "Predicting Students Graduate on Time Using C4.5 Algorithm". For your information, the manuscript has been carefully revised by a professional language editing service in order to meet journal standards.

We need authors to make final checking, please check especially on

1. Title of Paper
2. Authors' Name and Authors' Affiliation
3. Other errors in the manuscript
4. Provide us ORCID ID of the authors (if applicable)

Your confirmation is expected until **April 23rd, 2020, at 12.00 WIB** (GMT+7) by replying to this email. If there is no confirmation, then we assume that you accept this version for publication. Please note that changes after the publication date will be published in the form of erratum or corrigendum. Vol 7 No 1 (April) 2021 will be published on April 28th, 2021.

Thank you for publishing in the Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence

Best Regards,

Indra Kharisma Raharjana
Editor-in-Chief
jjisebi@journal.unair.ac.id

--

--

*Salam

Herman Yuliansyah, ST., M.Eng.

=====

*

Program Studi Teknik Informatika
Universitas Ahmad Dahlan

UNIVERSITAS AHMAD DAHLAN

Kampus 1: Jln. Kapas No. 9 Yogyakarta

Kampus 2: Jl. Pramuka 42, Sidikan, Umbulharjo, Yogyakarta 55161

Kampus 3: Jl. Prof. Dr. Soepomo, S.H., Janturan, Warungboto, Umbulharjo, Yogyakarta 55164

Kampus 4: Jl. Ringroad Selatan, Yogyakarta

Kampus 5: Jl. Ki Ageng Pemanahan 19, Yogyakarta

Kontak

Email: info@uad.ac.id

Telp. : (0274) 563515, 511830, 379418, 371120

Fax. : (0274) 564604

Merlinda Wibowo <merlinda@ittelkom-pwt.ac.id>
To: JISEBI Universitas Airlangga <jjisebi@journal.unair.ac.id>
Cc: Herman Yuliansyah <herman.yuliansyah@tif.uad.ac.id>

23 April 2021 at 11:48

Erratum:

The graduation predicate is addressed as Pass, Satisfactory, Very satisfactory, and **Distinction (Cumlaude)**.
---> In Tables 2 and 3, the **Praise** term should be changed to **Distinction (Cumlaude)**.

Thank you.

Pada tanggal Jum, 23 Apr 2021 pukul 05.01 Merlinda Wibowo <merlinda@ittelkom-pwt.ac.id> menulis:

Dear Editor,

Thank you for the information.

1. We found one error in the manuscript:

Page 69, we state that "The graduation predicate is addressed as Pass, Satisfactory, Very satisfactory, and Distinction (Cumlaude)." --> However, in Table 2 and 3, Distinction (Cumlaude) changed become Praise.

2. ORCID ID the other author:

- Anggit Wirasto: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1707-5979>
- Merlinda Wibowo: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1730-7258>

Thank you.

Pada tanggal Rab, 21 Apr 2021 pukul 14.37 Herman Yuliansyah <herman.yuliansyah@tif.uad.ac.id> menulis:

Thank you for your email.

On Wed, 21 Apr 2021 at 13:27, JISEBI Universitas Airlangga <jjisebi@journal.unair.ac.id> wrote:

Dear Authors,

Within this email, we attach a proofread version of your manuscript entitled "Predicting Students Graduate on Time Using C4.5 Algorithm". For your information, the manuscript has been carefully revised by a professional language editing service in order to meet journal standards.

We need authors to make final checking, please check especially on

1. Title of Paper
2. Authors' Name and Authors' Affiliation
3. Other errors in the manuscript
4. Provide us ORCID ID of the authors (if applicable)

Your confirmation is expected until **April 23rd, 2020, at 12.00 WIB** (GMT+7) by replying to this email. If there is no confirmation, then we assume that you accept this version for publication. Please note that changes after the publication date will be published in the form of erratum or corrigendum. Vol 7 No 1 (April) 2021 will be published on April 28th, 2021.

Thank you for publishing in the Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence

Best Regards,

Indra Kharisma Raharjana
Editor-in-Chief
jisebi@journal.unair.ac.id

--

--

*Salam

Herman Yuliansyah, ST., M.Eng.

=====

*

Program Studi Teknik Informatika
Universitas Ahmad Dahlan

UNIVERSITAS AHMAD DAHLAN

Kampus 1: Jln. Kapas No. 9 Yogyakarta

Kampus 2: Jl. Pramuka 42, Sidikan, Umbulharjo, Yogyakarta 55161

Kampus 3: Jl. Prof. Dr. Soepomo, S.H., Janturan, Warungboto, Umbulharjo, Yogyakarta 55164

Kampus 4: Jl. Ringroad Selatan, Yogyakarta

Kampus 5: Jl. Ki Ageng Pemanahan 19, Yogyakarta

Kontak

Email: info@uad.ac.id

Telp. : (0274) 563515, 511830, 379418, 371120

Fax. : (0274) 564604

--

Best Regards,

MERLINDA WIBOWO

Lecturer, Faculty of Informatics

Telkom Institute of Technology Purwokerto

Jl. D.I. Panjaitan No. 128 Purwokerto 53147

☎ +62 8522 0671 700